### Exhibit Y

## Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity

# Response 1 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 47, 48)

a) "The Family' begins with its protagonist, Anthony, narrating a chronological, detailed story of how he and his crew, labeled the 'NRP,' reaches the pinnacle of the Philadelphia drug trade by taking over rival drug crews and mini-organizations by controlling the best quality and largest quantity of cocaine. Anthony is speaking of past events from a prison cell."

Moreover, the idea of a gang employing violence to eliminate or take

Mobsters, Menace II Society, Get Rich or Die Tryin', and the BET's American

faire common in the genre, as exemplified in the films Goodfellar,

Gangster documentary series episodes The Chambers Brothers, Kenneth

"Supreme" McGriff, and Rayful Edmond III.

This claimed similarity of retrospective narration concerns a steme a

Lions Gate's Response

other films such as American Gangster, New Jack City, Menace II Society, Get

over tival gangs also concerns an unprotectible stene a faire evidenced in

Rich or Die Tryin', Mobsters, American Gangster, The Public Enemy, Year of the

- b) "State Property opens with its protagonist, Beans, narrating a chronological, detailed story of how he and his crew, labeled the 'ABM,' reached the pinnacle of the Philadelphia drug trade by taking over rival drug crews and mini-organizations by brute force and murder. The climax of State Property informs the viewers that Beans was also narrating from a prison cell."
- c) "The plot, setting, theme, overall essence, and feel of these two comparative elements are the same."

# Response 2 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 49, 50)

- a) "Relatively early in The Family,' Anthony introduces the readers to his most trusted associate and best friend, Mark and shortly thereafter the other two members of his crew, Dante and Shawn, the four which form the foundation of the 'NRP."
- **b)** "Relatively early in *State Property*, Beans introduces the viewers to Baby Boy, to whom he refers as his 'right hand,' as well as the remaining two members of the foundation of the 'ABM,' Blizz and D-Nice, thus also having a four member foundation."
- c)"The number of group members and the special bond between the leader and one group member are the same."

# Dragon, Hoodlum, and from the lives of actual gangsters, as demonstrated by the BET documentary series American Gangster in the episodes Felix "the Cat" Mitchell, Leroy "Nicky" Barnes, Rayful Edmonds III, Frank Lucas, and "Freeway" Ross where the gangster's life is narrated through a series of letters from prison.

This claimed similarity is a mischaracterization of both works.

Throughout *State Property*, the number of gang members fluctuates from two to six at any given time. In any event, the concept of a core group of four gang members, some designated with specific functions in the gang, is an unprotectible *stene a faire* in the gangster genre teadily apparent in the gangster films, *New Jack City, Get Rich or Die Tryin'*, *Mobsters*, and *Scarface*, as well as in the BET documentary series in the episode *The Chambers Brothers*.

## Lions Gate's Response Response 3 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity

- and the 'muscle,' while Dante and Shawn play supporting roles such as organization: Anthony is the leader and Mark is Anthony's 'right hand' "In 'The Family,' each member plays a specific role in the 'NRP' controlling and organizing the 'NRP' street workers and purchasing firearms." Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 51, 52) <u>a</u>
- hand,' Blizz is the 'muscle' and D-Nice controls and organizes 'ABM' street workers along with his partner P-Nut (who was recruited after 'ABM' organization: Beans is the leader and Baby Boy is his 'right b) "In State Property, each member also plays a specific role in the the 'ABM' was formed)."
- c) "The roles delegated to each member of the 'NRP' and the 'ABM' are substantially similar."

### Response 4 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 53, 54)

- that they lack sufficient funds to purchase a large amount of cocaine. Midnight' club in order to discuss their ultimate goal of 'taking over' cocaine in order to make large financial gains, but they both realize a) "In 'The Family,' Anthony and Mark discuss the idea of selling Shortly thereafter, the foundation of the NRP meet at the 'After the city of Philadelphia by controlling the city's drug trade."
- home, and that they need to come up with a large amount of purchase complaining to Baby Boy about being broke and his desire for a large b) "In State Property, while sitting in an after hours club, Beans is money in order to buy enough cocaine to take over the city of Philadelphia by controlling the city's drug trade."

As a preliminary matter, the idea of specialized roles within a gang admitted in paragraph 23 of his 56.1 Statement. (Lions Gate's 56.1 was central to the organization of the actual JBM, which Plaintiff Statement at ¶ 23; Plaintiff's 56.1 Statement at ¶ 23).

American Gangster (each member of the gang has a specialized role in the genre, as evidenced in the films New Jack City (each member is given an Moreover, this alleged similarity is mischaracterized. At no point in "The Family" is any gang member recruited based on any specific skill similarity also concerns an unprotectible seene a faire common in the assigned position during a meeting in the back of the nightclub), or responsibility, nor is anyone ever assigned one. This alleged operation of the gang), Mobsters (same), and Little Caesar (leader introduces members of the gang and their specialties).

commonly found in real life gangs, as depicted in the BET documentary American Gangster in the episodes The Chambers Brothers and Philly Black The idea that each member of the gang has a specific role is also Mafia.

the films New Jack City (idea to start selling crack and take over housing start selling bootlegged Canadian whiskey conceived in back room of a The alleged similarity here, poor inner city youths conceiving a plan concerns an exceedingly common seme a faire in the genre evidenced in speakeasy), and Scarface (idea of formally inducting Tony Montana into the gang and sharing plans to involve him in larger cocaine purchases project first conceived in back room of a nightclub), Mobiters (idea to to engage in an illegal enterprise while in the back of a nightclub, discussed in back of a nightclub).

Filed 05/30/2008

As for the notion that "financial gain," as a reason for drug-dealing is protectible, that would be the almost universal objective for such activities.

Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity	Lions Gate's Response
c) "The ideas of the leaders of each group to purchase a large amount of cocaine in order to take over the city of Philadelphia but lacking enough purchase money and discussing these goals in an after hours club are substantially similar."	
Response 5 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 55, 56)	This alleged similarity fails for three reasons. First, as Plaintiff admitted in his 56.1 statement, the motto "Get down or lay down" is the very motto employed by the actual IBM. (Lions Gate's 56.1
a) "In 'The Family,' the 'NRP' decided their ultimate goal would be to have the rival drug dealers and mini-organizations either working for them or being supplied by them. Moreover, the motto associated with the gang in 'The Family' is 'Be good or be gone.'"	Statement at \$\bigg[ 18; Plaintiff's 56.1 Statement at \$\bigg[ 18]\$. Second, the two mottos are entirely different and only share the word "or" in common. Third, the general idea that a gang employs a motto concerns an unprotectible seems a faire, as seen in \$Get Rich or Die Tryin" ("Getting paid ortting laid"). \( \text{Conface} (1932) \) ("Do it first do it vourself and keep on
crew, which was to have the rival drug dealers and mini-organizations either working for them or being supplied by them or being murdered by them [sic], and after murdering a rival drug dealer named 'Futch,' Beans made it known that the motto associated with him and his ABM crew was to either 'Get down or lay down."	doing it.), The Public Enemy ("They buy our beer or they don't buy any beer"), Scarface ("The world is yours"), as does the idea of utilizing violence to consolidate power (see p. 1, supra)
c) "The ultimate goals of each group are substantially similar. The four (4) word phrase of each group leader to be used as an identifier are substantially similar."	
Response 6 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶ 57, 58)	As with most of the cited similarities between the two works, the basis for the similarity is the actual events involving the JBM. The JBM was well known for having connections with Colombian cartels in
a) "In 'The Family,' the 'NRP' crew initially received cocaine from their connect [sic], 'Vinny', but they soon realized that he would not be able to satisfy their demand. Therefore, they eventually 'cut out the middle man' and dealt directly with June and his crew of Colombians that had a base of colombians.	Miami and would frequently travel there to purchase drugs long before either Plaintiff or Lions Gate incorporated this idea into their respective works, as Plaintiff admitted in ¶19 of his 56.1 Statement. (Lions Gate's 56.1 Statement at ¶ 19; Plaintiff's 56.1 Statement at ¶ 19).
often traveled in order to purchase several kilograms of cocaine on each trip."	Not only is "cut[ting] out the middle man" a hackneyed phrase, it is an unprotectible idea pervasive in the genre. Not surprisingly, when drug gangs, both real and fictional, attempt to cut out the middle man,

### fiction, as many real life gangs, in addition to the JBM, rose to power by to Bolivia to establish new drug connection), American Gangster (travels to Thailand to establish drug connection), and Year of the Dragon (same). films Starface (meets Colombian connection in Miami, and later travels establishing a connection directly with the supplier, as depicted in the The idea of cutting out the middle man is not limited to works of they establish a connection with foreign suppliers, as depicted in the BET American Gangster documentary series in the episodes "Freway" Ricky Ross, Troy & Dino Smith, Rayful Edmond III, and Frank Lucas. Lions Gate's Response Beans cut out the middleman and traveled themselves to Miami Beach, b) "In State Property, Beans and Baby Boy realized that in order to get c) "Although there was no strife between them, both Anthony and Florida in order to personally purchase larges kilograms of cocaine. a larger quantity and better quality of cocaine at more competitive Therefore, they traveled to Miami Beach, Florida to meet the new connect [sic], 'Mario' and his crew of Columbians [sic] in order to Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity The manner in which both leaders made conscious decisions to prices, they would eventually have to 'cut out the middle man.' purchase several kilograms of cocaine."

business and, not surprisingly, occurs frequently in the genre as seen in Get Rich or Die Tryin', American Gangster, Year of the Dragon, Scarface, and American Gangster to name just a few examples. Thus, a discussion of An appraisal of the purity of a drug is critical to any drug dealer's

the drug's purity is hardly copyrightable expression.

### Response 7 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint <table-cell-rows> 59, 60)

cocaine, as opposed to sending a worker, as well as, assuming the risk

assume the risk involved in personally purchasing the weight of

in whatever strife may develop by cutting out the middleman is the

- a) "In 'The Family,' while doing the deal in Miami Beach, Mark told Anthony that the cocaine they were getting was close to '90 percent
- that they were purchasing, Mario looked at Beans and Baby Boy and b) "In State Property, while in Miatni Beach, after testing the cocaine stated in part, 'See, es puro' (it's pure)."
- c) "The quality of cocaine purchased by each group is substantially

## Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity

# Response 8 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 61, 62)

- a) "In 'The Family,' Anthony disclosed to Mark his feelings of discomfort with the new connect [sic] in Miami Beach because not only did they 'cut out the middle man,' but they did not understand the Spanish being spoken by the cocaine suppliers."
- b) "In State Property, Beans was extremely uncomfortable while in Miami Beach and expressed this to Baby Boy stating in part, 'I don't trust these Spanish speaking Gwala Gwalas' … 'We just cut out the middle man."
- c) "The feelings of discomfort expressed by the leader of each group with the new suppliers based on the fact that the suppliers were speaking Spanish coupled with the fact that each group 'cut out the middleman' is the same."

### Lions Gate's Response

This is really part and parcel of the alleged similarity listed above. As discussed above, the idea of Colombian drug dealers did not originate with Plaintiff. In fact, as Plaintiff admitted in his 56.1 Statement, the actual JBM was renowned for dealing with Colombian drug dealers and would frequently travel to Miami to engage in drug deals with Colombian cartels. (Lions Gate's 56.1 Statement at ¶ 19). As Spanish is the national language of Colombia and the first language of most Colombians, it is not surprising that both drug dealers speak Spanish.

To the extent both characters feel unease during their drug purchase from Colombian drug dealers, the respective sources of unease are disparate. In "The Family," Anthony feels discomfort stemming from the language barrier, whereas in State Property, Beans is uneasy because of the inherent dangers of engaging in a drug deal itself, much like the character in Scarface. Furthermore, the idea of tensions between different ethnic groups concerns a common stene a faire, as seen in Hoodlum (tension between African-American and Italian gangs, tension between Hispanic and Italians gangs including discomfort with Spanish being spoken), Scarface (tension between Colombian, Bolivian and Cuban gangs), Mobsters (tension between Jewish and Italian gangs), Get Rich or Die Tryin' (tension between Italian, Jamaican, and African-American gangs).

Consistent with Plaintiff's superficial comparisons at the level of uncopyrightable <u>ideas</u> as opposed to protectible <u>expression</u>, the settings of the two drug deals are only similar to the extent that they both involve drugs and are conducted in a house. The similarities end there. The house in "The Family" is described as "A gothic building with two Olympic-sized pools." Not only is the drug dealer's house in *State Property* modern as opposed to Gothic (an architectural style noted for its counterbalanced buttresses, ribbed vaulting, and pointed arches), but there is only one pool which is clearly shorter than the 55 x 23 yards of an Olympic-sized pool. <u>See</u>

Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity	Lions Gate's Response
	http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/gothic ("gothic"); http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/olympic-sized ("Olympic-sized").
Response 9 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 63, 64)	This alleged similarity is premised on another mischaracterization by Plaintiff. In "The Family," Anthony is depicted as a pensive man who is from any total by the pensitive effects his days dealing lifestule have
a) "Throughout the plot of The Family, although Anthony often speaks of the healthy relationship he desires with his girlfriend Lauren and their daughter Shatora, his actions prove otherwise as he almost completely ignores the two in favor of his business and another woman, Kimmy."	on his family. Beans, on the other hand, is depicted as a homicidal sociopath who enters the drug business solely as a means to attain greater wealth and power and largely ignores its effect on his family other than the isolated incident — not present in the "The Family"—when his girlfriend is kidnapped.
b) "Throughout the plot of State Property, Beans often speaks of the healthy relationship he has with his girlfriend Aisha and alleges that he would do anything for his unnamed daughter; however, shortly after his daughter's fifth birthday party, he appears to completely ignore his daughter and Aisha in favor of his business and the 'ABM' crew."	In any event, the idea of a drug dealer prioritizing his business at the expense of family concerns an unprotectible seene a faire as depicted in American Gangster (gang leader refuses to leave his life of crime despite his wife's pleas that he do so for his family) and Scarface (gang leader relentlessly builds his criminal empire at the expense of his relationship with his mother and sister).
c) "The fact that each group leader expresses a desire to have a healthy relationship with their respective families, although neither character manifested his desire but instead showed more time, commitment and interest to their business and business partners is substantially similar."	
Response 10 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 65, 66)	This alleged similarity is an unprotectible idea that is common to any gang that aspires to control the drug trafficking business in a particular
a) "In 'The Family,' after purchasing the large quantities of cocaine from Miami Beach, the 'NRP' crew members give a description of the manner in which they will take over city of Philadelphia, including giving detailed descriptions of which section of the city is controlled by which member of the 'NRP' crew."	city of neignborhood, as evidenced by wew jack Cay (gang leader describes taking over Harlem drug trade), Hoodlum (same), Scarface, and American Gangster.

Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity	Lions Gate's Response
b) "In State Property, after purchasing the large quantities of cocaine from Miami Beach, Beans gives a detailed description of the manner in which the 'ABM' crew was to take over the city of Philadelphia, including detailed descriptions of which section of the city is controlled by which member of the 'ABM' crew, stating in part, 'We [sic] taking over the city of Philly like John. Street."	
c) "The manner in which each member gave an accurate description of their plans to take over the city of Philadelphia, including each section of the city being assigned to each member of each respective group is substantially similar."	
Response 11 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 67, 68)	Not only is this clichéd phrase not within the protections of the Copyright Act, but it is a phrase as old as the Bible, appearing in Psalm
a) "In 'The Family,' Anthony describes the ability to 'enjoy the fruits of our labor,' referring to the hard work put in on the streets of Philadelphia by the 'NRP' crew."	labor; blessings and prosperity will be yours." Additionally, it is commonplace in the genre in films such as New Jack City, where the main character recites, "To the fruit of our hard work."
b) "In State Property, while having a meeting with the members of his 'ABM' crew and prior to rewarding them with women and jewelry, Beans describes the hard work put in on the streets of Philadelphia and that it is time to 'enjoy the fruits of our fucking labor."	
c) "The manner in which each leader acknowledges the hard work put in by their respective groups and describes it as 'the fruits of our labor' is substantially similat."	
Response 12 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 69, 70)	Once again, Plaintiff has based an alleged similarity on an element whose source can be traced directly to the actual IBM, the gang that
a) "In The Family, the 'NRP' crew shopped for diamond rings which they ultimately ordered from 'this Jewish Jeweler,' that were inscribed with the initials 'NRP' to signify their unity and success."	terrorized the same Philadelphia neighborhoods where Plaintiff and Anderson both grew up, as Plaintiff admitted in paragraphs 1, 2 and 14 of his 56.1 Statement. (Lions Gate's 56.1 Statement at ¶¶ 1, 2, 14);

Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity	
	paragraph
<b>b)</b> "In State Property, Beans awarded himself and the members of the	known fo
'ABM' crew that were 'down from day one' with diamond rings that	diamond
they purchased from 'Ell' played by Jacob Arabo a/k/a Jacob the	22; Plainti
Jeweler, that were inscribed with the initials 'ABM' to signify their	paragraph
unity and success."	Jacob Ara

were awarded with diamond rings purchased from a Jewish jeweler, c) "The fact that the respective founding members of each group bearing the groups' respective initials, is the same."

29).

### h 28 and 29 of his 56.1 Statement, that Jacob the Jewelet, a/k/a rings encrusted with "JBM." (Lions Gate's 56.1 Statement at ¶ iff's 56.1 Statement at ¶ 22). Finally, Plaintiff further admits in Jacob Arabo, is a well known jeweler who has made much of his living selling diamond encrusted pieces of jewelry to hip hop stars. (Lions h 22, Plaintiff also admitted that the actual IBM was widely or not only adorning themselves with flashy jewelry, but

Lions Gate's Response

Moreover, the similarity alleged by Plaintiff simply mischaracterizes the cohorts plain diamond rings, whereas in "The Family" the rings are tings putchased in State Property. In State Property, Beans gives his adorned with the letters of the gang. In any event, gang members adorning themselves with flashy jewelry throughout the genre, as seen in New Jack City, Scarface, Little Caesar and is another unprotectible idea that concerns a seme a faire commonplace Original Gangstas where the gang members can consistently be seen wearing flashy diamond jewelry.

City where the Cash Money Brothers, or "CMB," displayed the initials themselves with the gang's name or abbreviation, as seen in New Jack It is also common for gangs to name themselves and adorn "CMB" on their clothes, hats, and even hair.

BET documentary series American Gangster in the episodes Lorenzo "Fat Real gangs were also known for their flashy jewelry as seen in the Cat" Nichols and Felix "the Cat" Mitchell

## Response 13 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity

## Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 71, 72)

- any longer, thus alerting the reader that Anthony needed to purchase a gulfriend advises him that she cannot stay in her parent's [sic] home "In "The Family,' while pregnant with their daughter, Anthony's home for himself and his family." <u>a</u>
- b) "In State Property, while complaining to Baby Boy, Beans refers to they do not have a home of their own, thus expressing to the viewer having to sneak around his girlfriend's parent's [sic] home because that he desperately needed to purchase a home for himself and his girlfriend."
- living arrangement with their respective girlfriends and this motivates c) "The fact that the leader of each group feels pressured by the them to make money at any cost in order to purchase a home is substantially similar."

## Response 14 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 73, 74)

- organizations that were robbing their dealers on the street corners as a) "In The Family,' the 'NRP' crew dealt violently with rival drug well as, robbing their 'stash houses.""
- b) "In State Property, the 'ABM' crew robbed rival drug dealers on the street corners as well as, rival dealers delivering to [sic] drugs to their 'stash houses.""

### Family," Anthony's girlfriend wants a home of her own in order to raise make it easier to satisfy his desire to have sex. Furthermore, contrary to Plaintiff attempts to fashion an apparent similarity between the two a family. In State Property, Beans wants a house only because it would Beans is moving out of the city for safety concerns. (Opp. Br. at 18). Plaintiff's assertions, there is nothing in State Property to indicate that plots where, in fact, the two situations are quite disparate. In "The

Lions Gate's Response

common theme prevelant in films from the gangster genre including Get house once the baby arrives) and Menace II Society (much of the story is driven by gangster's love interest pressuring him to leave Los Angeles, Rich or Die Tryin' (pregnant girlfriend implores gang leader to buy a In any event, the desire to move out into one's own home is a where he lives with his grandparents, for a new home with her in Atlanta).

house in the suburbs is an idea protected by the Copyright Act. (Opp. protectible expression and concerns a common sene a faire in the gang Plaintiff similarly argues in his opposition brief that moving into a Br. 17-19). However, the idea of moving into a new house is not genre, as seen in Scarface, Menace II Society, and American Gangster.

Document 64-2

attacking rival gangs and factions, as Plaintiff admitted in paragraphs 14, 19, 20, and 21 of his 56.1 Statement. (Lions Gate's 56.1 Statement at ¶¶ Once again, the actual JBM, the ultra-violent Philadelphia drug gang on which State Property was based, was renowned for robbing and 14, 19, 20, 21; Plaintiff's 56.1 Statement at ¶¶ 14, 19, 20, 21)

ideas is entirely different. In "The Family," it is Anthony's drug gang committing robberies or otherwise attacking rival gangs concerns a commonplace seene a faire as seen in Scarface and Get Rich or Die Tryin'. who is robbed by other gangs, whereas in State Property, it is Beans's gang actual historical events, Plaintiff ignores that the expression of these Moreover, beyond the fact that this alleged similarity is based on who commits the robbery. As discussed above, the idea of gangs

# Response 15 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 75, 76)

- a) "In 'The Family,' the men devised a plan to retaliate on [sic] a rival drug dealer named Jabril by using a woman that was romantically involved with a member of the 'NRP' in order to set Jabril up to be murdered."
- b) "In State Property, the men devised a plan to set up Sharef, a rival drug dealer by using a woman that became romantically involved with a member of the 'ABM' crew, who in turn set up Sharef to be murdered."
- c) "The fact that a woman who was romantically involved with a member of the respective groups and was used to set up a rival drug dealer to be murdered is substantially similar."

# Response 16 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 77, 78)

- a) "In 'The Family,' since the 'NRP' crew was making so much money and they figuratively took over the city of Philadelphia, they were forced to bribe the local police departments."
- b) "In State Property, since the 'ABM' allegedly took over every section of the city of Philadelphia, Baby Boy was seen making bribery payments to the local police patrolling those sections."
- c)"The fact that both groups were bribing local police departments in order to assure their businesses would prosper is substantially similar."

however, it is *the girffriend of the rival gang member* who Beans uses to "set up" her boyfriend with whom she was already acquainted and romantically involved.

recognizes, in "The Family," Anthony's mistress "sets up" a rival drug

This alleged point of similarity represents another superficial mischaracterization by Plaintiff. As Plaintiff's own complaint

dealer, whom she never met, to be assassinated. In State Property,

To the extent Plaintiff claims there is a similarity in the idea of gangs using women to assassinate a rival drug dealer, this idea is common in the genre as depicted in New Jack City, where Keisha, a cohort of the gang leader Nino Brown, assassinates a rival drug dealer. Furthermore, real life gangs as depicted in the BET documentary series American Gangster in the episode Tryy & Dino Smith, used women as lookouts and decoys for the gang.

As one would expect, the idea of bribing police concerns a seen a faire in the gangster film genre, as seen in American Gangster and Scarface, where both gangsters are forced to bribe police officers as their criminal empire grows larger and attracts more attention. Moreover, depictions of bribery present in "Fort Apache," a book about police and criminal elements in the South Bronx, were found to be unprotectible scenes a faire. Walker v. Time Life Films, Inc., 615 F. Supp. 430, 436 (S.D.N.Y. 1985) (holding the film Fort Apache: The Bronx did not infringe plaintiff's book), affed, 784 F.2d 44 (2d Cir. 1986).

In any event, Plaintiff fails to allege any similarity of expression in how the police are bribed, and instead is merely alleging that both works share the same unprotectible idea and concept.

## Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity

## Response 17 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 79, 80)

- dealt with a heroin dealer in order to make more money, and this was being disloyal to the 'NRP' crew. Ultimately, Shawn was set up by his "In 'The Family,' Shawn, a founding member of the 'NRP' crew, viewed by remaining members as not only being greedy, but also as own crew and murdered." <u>a</u>
- complained that Beans was the only member making 'any real money,' and this was viewed by Beans and Baby Boy as not only being greedy, but also as being disloyal to the 'ABM' crew. Ultimately, Blizz was set b) "In State Property, Blizz, a founding member of the "ABM" crew, up by Beans and killed in a shoot out with police."
- "The fact that a founding member of each crew was seen as being disloyal and greedy and ultimately set up by their own crew to be murdered is substantially similar." ত

### Lions Gate's Response

renowned for its internal disputes, which often ended with one member This alleged similarity can also be traced to the real JBM, which was 56.1 Statement. (Lions Gate's 56.1 Statement at ¶¶ 20, 21; Plaintiff's being murdered, as Plaintiff admitted in paragraphs 20 and 21 of his 56.1 Statement at ¶¶ 20, 21).

gang's code, but also commits the actual murder. Anthony, the putative Family," it is Mark, a mere rank and file member of the gang, who not gang member is expressed very differently in the two works. In "The leader, remains consistently opposed to the idea and even objects on Beyond its shared historical basis, the idea of eliminating a fellow only conceives of the plan to murder Shawn as a punishment for his greed in pursuing an independent heroin venture in violation of the several occasions, and plays no part in the execution. In State Property, on the other hand, Beans, the gang leader, unidaterally expressed jealously of Beans's seemingly disparate wealth. Unlike Shawn makes the decision to eliminate Blizz. Contrary to Mark's motivation fellow gang member. Rather, Blizz dies as a result of a shoot out with Moreover, in stark contrast to "The Family," Blizz is not killed by a in "The Family," Beans reaches his decision solely based on Blizz's in "The Family," Blizz was not involved in any side drug ventures. the police which is set up by Beans.

Document 64-2

as disloyal concerns an unprotectible seme a fair exceedingly common in the idea of a gang leader killing a fellow gang member who is perceived Rich or Die Tryin' (gang member killed for attempting to work with tival make a drug deal on the side and breaking the gang's code of ethics to the gang genre, as seen in Hoodlum (gang member killed for attempted did, Gee."), Little Caesar (gang member killed for attempting to go to the police with information about the gang), Untouchables (same), Get Even if the expressions of this idea were similar in the two works, not use drugs himself..."You cut a side deal...Yes, you did. Yes, you assassination), New Jack City (gang member killed for attempting to gang) and Scarface (gang member killed for turning state's witness). Document 64-2

## Once again, Plaintiff claims a similarity where there is none. The two phrases are actually different and share only two words in common. Response 18 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity

# Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 81, 82)

Moreover, it is axiomatic that simple words and phrases, particularly

Lions Gate's Response

hackneyed expressions, like "weak link," are not copyrightable.

- founding member of the 'NRP' crew blatantly stated, 'We are going to "In 'The Family,' in reference to Shawn's obvious greed, a have to remove the weak link to tighten the chain."" <u>a</u>
- b) "In State Property, in reference to Blizz's obvious envy and greed, Beans blatantly stated, 'We can't have no [sic] weak links in this family ...
- recognized but expressed their opinion about another member's greed and both used phrase 'weak link' in describing the soon murdered c) "The fact that a member of each respective crew not only members is substantially similar."

## Response 19 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 83, 84)

- "In 'The Family,' Anthony's girlfriend begged him to "get out of accepted the perks of such a lifestyle, witnessing a murder in her the fast life" because she had a dream that he was killed. Hence, although she was aware that Anthony was a drug dealer and she dreams caused her to beg him to stop dealing drugs."
- she was well aware that Beans and his 'ABM' crew were drug dealers Tonya murdered by a rival drug crew led by Boss Dame'. Although murder caused her to go into a state of shock wherein she begged and she accepted the home, jewelry and other perks, witnessing a b) "In State Property, Beans' girlfriend Aisha witnessed her friend Beans to stop dealing drugs."
- c) "The role played by each leader's girlftiend in accepting the perks stimuli, namely a murder, and as a result begging each leader to stop that come with such a volatile lifestyle but experiencing the same dealing drugs is substantially similar."

"The Family," Anthony's girlfriend is vehemently opposed to Anthony's she never witnesses a murder but only dreams about it. In State Property, on scenes, which are markedly dissimilar in copyrightable expression. In Plaintiff mischaracterizes this alleged similarity between these two Anthony keeps her largely insulated from its violent aspects. Indeed, violence after being kidnapped and actually witnessing the death of her involvement in the drug business from the beginning. Accordingly, friend (not her boyfriend as in "The Family") that she finally pleads the other hand, Beans's girlfriend, Iesha, is largely complacent with Beans's criminal profession. It is only after her direct exposure to with Beans to abandon his criminal life.

protagonist to get out of the gangster lifestyle, this concerns a seene a faire To the extent Plaintiff claims the idea of a love interest begging the common in the gang gente, as seen in American Gangster, Hoodlum, and Menaee II Society, where the love interests beg the gang member to abandon the gang lifestyle after witnessing a violent act.

Lions Gate's Response	

# Response 20 to Interrogatory No. 4 of Lions Gate's Second Set of Interrogatories (Complaint ¶¶ 85, 86)

Plaintiff's Description of Claimed Similarity

- a) "In The Family," Anthony owned several automobile detailing shops across the city as well as, in Camden, Trenton and Newark."
- b) "In State Property, Ceaser [sic] was a character that owned an automobile detailing shop in Philadelphia and it was there that Beans shot him several times. Ceaser [sic] wound up being the character that was to ultimately testify against Beans putting him away for life."
- c) "The fact that an automobile detailing shop was even mentioned in both "The Family" and State Property is substantially similar."

This alleged similarity has its roots with the actual JBM, which was renowned for using auto detailing shops as fronts for its illegal enterprises, as Plaintiff admitted in paragraph 24 of his 56.1 Statement. (Lions Gate's 56.1 Statement at ¶ 24; Plaintiff's 56.1 Statement at ¶ 24).

Again, this claimed similarity is mischaracterized in any event. First, C-zer's business in State Property appears to sell only car parts and nothing indicates it is a detailing shop. Even if both stores were detailing shops, however, the manner in which they appear in the works is entirely different. In "The Family," Anthony owns several detailing shops as fronts for his illegal enterprise. In State Property, Beans never owns a detailing shop. Rather, it is C-zer, a minor character unaffiliated with the gang, who owns the shop. The idea of an auto detailing shop in a film in the gangster genre is also an unprotectible idea and a seme a faire, as seen in American Gangster.

### Exhibit Z

Wed, Mar 12, 2008 3:56 PM

Subject: IMS Expert Services - Search Date: Monday, February 4, 2008 4:00 PM

From: Mark Silver <msilver@ims-expertservices.com>

To: moreno@sundree.tv

Conversation: IMS Expert Services - Search

### Victor:

It was a pleasure to speak with you regarding your need for experts in the above case. This email serves to summarize and confirm our conversation. Please review the case background and expert requirements including the provisions that follow and reply with any changes or clarifications or confirm that all is correct and acceptable by replying in the affirmative. We will then begin our search. After we have the 'specs' for this expert confirmed, I will forward to you the information for the damages expert/ Our understanding of the case background and requirements are as follows:

### Case Background:

Our client, Victor Dunlop of Dunlop & Associates - Brooklyn, NY, represents the plaintiff, Antonne Jones, in this litigation alleging Copyright Infringement, Unfair Competition, Misappropriation, and related claims. These claims are in relation to a book Mr. Jones wrote: The Family - A Philadelphia Mob Story.

This case is filed in the USDC, Southern District of NY.

Mr. Jones is a well-known writer. In 1998 prior to "The Family" being published, Mr. Jones met with the defendants in an effort to sell them the rights to the story as the basis for a movie. The parties were unable to agree upon a price (Dash, Carter et al offered \$50,000, Mr. Jones was desirous of being paid \$500,000 for the rights). After their meetings, the defendants were to call back with a better offer, however, Mr. Jones never heard back from them.

"The Family" was subsequently successfully published and released in 1999.

In 2002, the defendants released their movie, entitled "State Property". The similarities between the story written by Jones and the movie were numerous and striking, according to the complaint. It is alleged that the movie is based upon Jones' book, and done so with disregard to the intellectual property owned by Jones.

(Shawn Carter is a/k/a "Jay-Z" - a well known rap artist)

### **Expert Required:**

We seek an expert in copyright issues, as they relate to book-to-movie rights and licensing. This expert will understand the legal implications involved in the licensing of the rights of a book/manuscript for the purpose of making a movie. He/she is likely an Attorney and/or personal agent of authors, and has experience in negotiating book-to-movie 'deals'.

FAX ND. :7184039593

Mar. 12 2008 03:06PM P2

This expert will be expected to review case files and documentation as well as pertinent materials, such as the book and the movie screenplay. The expert will consult with and advise our client on the issues involved in book-to-movie deals of similar nature to the instant case. The expert will be expected to also opine in report, declarations and (if necessary) depositions and trial. Prior testimony experience is preferred, but not required. Document review, and report writing may be performed at expert's location. Meetings with counsel may be required in NYC. Depo and trial (if necessary) will be in NYC. An expert located in the NYC Area is strongly preferred.

### Parties:

Defendants - Roc-A-Fella Films Inc., Lions Gate Films Inc., Damon Dash, Shawn Carter Plaintiff - Antonne M. Jones

IMS Requirements: IMS accepts this search on an exclusive basis through February 25, 2008. We request that no other expert search or referral service of any kind be given your permission to search or submit candidates with regard to the expert needed in the case above until after this date. We will locate, evaluate and qualify a short list of experts that meet your needs. These experts will be presented to you within an information packet containing resumes, fee structures and an IMS contract. You have the opportunity to interview any or all of the candidates and you ultimately make the selection. You are not required to use a candidate provided by IMS, however should you use one of our experts you agree to engage them through IMS. All correspondence and discussions regarding the commercial aspects of this engagement will pass through IMS. This includes invoices, payments, discussions of fees, discounts and bids/proposals. As part of our service to both you and the expert, IMS manages all aspects of the contracts, invoices, collections and payments allowing you to focus on the case.

It is our standard practice to bill you every 30 days for time and expenses invoiced to us by the expert. Payment is due to IMS net 30. It is in the best interest of all parties' that we charge a retainer, to be paid upon the expert(s) engagement. We do this to attract and retain the best quality experts, with no concern on their part of having their fees contingent upon the outcome of the claim, and to avoid work stoppages due to late payments.

We pride ourselves on outstanding customer service. I will take care of everything that you need before, during and after the engagement. All case discussions and documents will be held in strictest confidence.

We appreciate the opportunity to serve you in this important matter and are confident that

Case 1:07-cv-03648-HB-KNF Document 64-2 Filed 05/30/2008 Page 18 of 28 FAX NB. :7184039593 Mar. 12 2008 03:06PM P3

you'll find IMS ExpertServices will meet or exceed your expectations.

Regards,

### Mark S. Silver

Client Manager

IMS ExpertServices

Not Just Experts, Expertise 850.473.2530 Voice 850.473.2525 Fax

www.ims-expertservices.com <a href="http://www.ims-expertservices.com/">http://www.ims-expertservices.com/>

Denver ~ Pensacola ~ Atlanta

This message contains PRIVILEGED AND CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION intended solely for the use of the addressee(s) named above. Any disclosure, distribution, copying or use of the information by others is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please advise the sender by immediate reply and delete the original message. Thank you.

### Exhibit AA

### DUNLOP & ASSOCIATES, P.C.

Document 64-2

A PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION 55 WASHINGTON STREET, SUITE 451 BROOKLYN, NEW YORK 11201 (718) 403-9261 TELEPHONE (614) 455-9261 FACSIMILE

March 5, 2008

Via Facsimile (323) 343-6467

Dr. Robert Vianello 570 Shepard Street San Pedro, California 90731

Re: Jones v. Roc-A-Fella Films, Inc., et al. – 07 cv 3648 (KNF) Southern District of New York

Dear Dr. Vianello:

This is to inform you that the plaintiff, Antonne M. Jones, in the above-styled action is interested in listing you as an expert witness based on our last conversation on or about March 5, 2008 and he may require your testimony at trial. Under the federal rules of civil of procedure, we are required to obtain the following items from you and to submit the same to the defendant(s) prior to March 11, 2008:

- 1. A report detailing your analysis of the plaintiff's claim against the listed defendants for copyright infringement, included but not limited to a brief comparative analysis between the plaintiff's work, The Family, A Philadelphia Mob Story, and the defendants' work, State Property;
- 2. A list of data or other information, including scholarly journals, treatises or articles that you may have relied upon in forming your opinions, diagnoses, and/or prognoses, if any;
- 3. A list of any exhibits, including scholarly journals, treatises or articles that you may use at trial to summarize or to elucidate your opinions;
- 4. A list of scholarly journals, treatises or articles that you may have authored in the last ten years;
- 5 A list of matters in which you have given testimony, under oath, as an expert

witness in the last four years;

- 6. Your curricula vitae and any evidence that you are qualified to render the opinions contained in your report; and
- 7. Your standard hourly rate for serving as an expert witness.

Kindly contact me or Mr. Ambrose Wotorson, Esq. at (718) 797-4861 upon your receipt of this correspondence to ensure we meet the court's deadline of March 11, 2008.

Respectfully submitted,

SOCIATES, P.C. DUNLOP & A

By:

Ambrose W. Wotorson, Esq. cc:

Antonne M. Jones

### Exhibit BB

### Robert Vianello, Ph.D

570 Shepard Street San Pedro, California 90731

Home: 310 241-0804 Fax: 310 241-0806 Work: 323 343-4213 Fax 323 343-6467

### **Academic Employment:**

1983 - 2003Professor, Department of Communication Studies

> Television, Film and Media Studies Area California State University / Los Angeles

1992 – 2003 Occasional Visiting Professor,

Department of Film, Television and Digital Media University of California at Los Angeles

### **Teaching Specialties:**

The History of American Television Ideological Analysis of Television Programming Television Theory and Criticism The Economics and Production Practices of the Television Industry **Television Advertising** Textual Analysis of Film

### **Selected Graduate Courses Taught:**

Television Programming California State University / Los Angeles Critical Theory of Film Department of Communication Studies

Television Criticism University of Southern California

Department of Cinema / Television

Television History **UCLA** 

Television Criticism Department of Film / Television

Television and Society

Contemporary Television Programming

Advanced Film and Video Production CSU Summer Arts Post Production in the Digital Age Course Coordinator

The Aesthetics, Economics and Seminars with Professor Alan Bloom Production Practices of Music Video American Film Institute /

Sony Video Institute

### Professor Robert Vianello (cont'd)

### **Selected Administrative Experience:**

- 1988 -- 1995 Associate Chair, Department of Communication Studies California State University Los Angeles
- 1997 -- 2001 Associate Editor, JOURNAL OF FILM AND VIDEO University Film and Video Association

### Selected Publications:

"The Rise of the Telefilm and the Networks' Hegemony over the Film Industry" appearing in AMERICAN TELEVISION / New Directions in History and Theory Edited by Nick Browne; Harwood Academic Publishers; USA 1994

"The Impact of Government Regulation on the Entertainment Industry in the Next Ten Years" in THE FUTURE OF THE ENTERTAINMENT INDUSTRY published by The Planning Forum, Spring 1989

LECTURES GIVEN BY AMERICAN PROFESSORS NICK BROWNE and ROBERT VIANELLO ON AMERICAN TELEVISION published by China Central Television in Beijing, The Peoples Republic of China

"The Power Politics of 'Live' Television" in THE JOURNAL OF FILM AND VIDEO, vol. 37, number 3, Summer 1985

"Profile: Rock Videos" co-authored with Alan Bloom in NO! CONTEMPORARY AMERICAN DADA, Published by The Henry Gallery of Art, University of Washington: Seattle, Washington (November, 1985)

"The Researchers Guide to Primary Television Materials in the United States," in the QUARTERLY REVIEW OF FILM STUDIES (Special Issue on Television; Winter 1985); Authored with Dan Einstein of the UCLA FILM AND TELEVISION **ARCHIVES** 

"La Domination de la TV americaine sur l'industrie cinematographique" translated from the English in FILMECHANGE No.26 (Printemps, 1984) Paris

"Cinema, Televisione e Stato" in HOLLYWOOD IN PROGRESS: ITINERARI CINEMA TELEVISIONE. Edited by Vito Zaggarrio, Quaderni della Mostra Internazionale del Nuovo Cinema: "Hollywood 6" (Venice, Italy: Marsilio Editori, 1984) p.167-179

"La nascita del telefilm": in HOLLYWOOD VERSO LA TELEVISIONE GLI ANNI '50 (Mostra Internazionale del Nuovo Cinema Internazionale Retrospettiva, Ancona 13-18 dicembre 1983)

### Professor Robert Vianello (cont'd)

### Selected Production Credits and Awards:

(Co-Producer with Professor Alan Bloom / Second Unit Director)

### "TEACHING, IMAGINE IT"

(Spot Campaign Promoting the Teaching Profession) Spokespersons: Edward James Olmos; Daphne Zuniga; LeVar Burton Awarded a "Telly"--the National Award for Public Service Announcements

### "IT'S MORE THAN JUST DOCTORS AND NURSES"

(Spots for Allied Health Care)

Spokespersons: Gates McFadden; Ada Maris

"LET THE BELLS RING" (Music Video)

"GET THE POWER, GET AN EDUCATION"

(Thirty and Sixty Second Spots promoting education and teaching as a career to Afro-American youth)

Spokespersons: LeVar Burton, Kim Fields, Roger Guenveur Smith and over 10 other celebrities

"ALL YOU CAN DREAM"

(Music Video and Spots)

Spokespersons: Kareem Abdul-Jabbar, Ricardo Montalban and some twenty other celebrities "Best Media Campaign of 1986" Public Interest Radio and Television Society "Silver Angel" / International Television Association

Producer on Various Music Videos as Teaching Projects for Production Students

Coordinated intensive two week seminars in 35mm production including AVID Digital Editing Experience for the California State University Summer Arts Program

Page 26 of 28

### Professor Robert Vianello (cont'd)

### Selected Papers, Panels, and Lectures:

Lecture: "The Political Economy of American Television" given in the "Seminar on Popular Culture" on invitation by Dr. Elihu Katz, Dean of the Annenberg School of Communication / USC and University of Pennsylvania

Document 64-2

Panel: "The Impact of Government Regulation on the Entertainment Industry in the 'Nineties" Southern California Planning Forum's Conference on "Strategic Issues in the Entertainment Industry"

Other participants were:

Stan Corwyn, President Warner New Media Lawrence Kirk, Corporate Director of Planning, MCA, Inc. Barbara Watson, Vice President Strategic Planning, NBC Bill Hoagland, Director of Marketing, United Cable

Paper: "The Ideology of Television News in China and the United States" at the Society of Cinema Studies and University Film and Video Association's (Combined Annual Conference)

Lecture: "Television Programming in the United States" and "Developing a Film and Television Studies Program" Beijing Broadcasting Institute in the Peoples Republic of China

Paper: "Network News in the People's Republic of China" Annual Conference of the Western Speech Association

Lecture: "Television Studies: The Emerging Discipline" to graduate students and faculty, Department of Cinema / Television, University of Southern California

### Organized panel:

"Television Programming in the Era of Audience Fragmentation" Moderator: Nicholas Johnson, Former FCC Commissioner Panelists: Garth Ancier, Fox Broadcasting Company Chris Albrecht, V.P., Original Programming, HBO Danny Arnold, Writer/Director/Producer and Co-Creator of BARNEY MILLER Gary Franklin, Media Critic KABC

Co-Chaired Panels: 1) "The Business of Music Video" 2) "The Art of Music Video" University Film and Video Association's Annual Conference in Los Angeles

### Professor Robert Vianello (cont'd)

Paper: "The Relationship between Major Film Production and Cable Television" Society for Cinema Studies Conference in Madison, Wisconsin

Lecture: "The Economic Structure of the Television Industry in the United States" Ph.D. Seminar, Department of Film and Television, UCLA

Lecture: "The Structure and Ideological Impact of Television Advertising in the United States" Ph.D. Seminar, Department of Film and Television, UCLA

Lecture: "Television, Advertising, and Ideology" NATIONAL ENDOWMENT FOR THE HUMANITIES SEMINAR in Los Angeles

Paper: "Television, Hollywood and the State" at the Mostra Internationale del Nuovo Cinema in Ancona, Italy

Lecture: "The Rise of the Telefilm and the Network Monopoly" at the SOCIETY FOR CINEMA STUDIES Annual Conference at UCLA

In the era of Public Affairs Programming, Appeared frequently on local talk shows on such topics as:

"The Business of Television"

"Television and Children's Advertising"

"Television and Education"

"The Fairness Doctrine"

"Television in China"

### Professional Services include:

### Expert Witness regarding the Film, Television, and Television Advertising Industries

Burgess v. The Coca-Cola Company
Joseph B. Haynes and Norwood Jameson,
King & Spalding, Atlanta, Ga.

(My testimony defending The Coca-Cola Company's Intellectual Property of the Polar Bear "Always Coke" TV Ads in a one hundred million dollar litigation resulted in a Summary Judgment in favor of my client. Services included the creation of written and videotape evidence for the Court.)

Zevallos v. Friedman

(Testimony on Child Labor Practices in the Film and Television Industry)

### Professor Robert Vianello (cont'd)

### Expert Witness (cont'd)

Dr. Melvyn S. Schwartz v. Multimedia Sonnenschein, Nath & Rosenthal, Los Angeles

(Testimony on Production Costs of Television Commercials)

Nelson v. SCIE, LLC dba Entertainment Partners Services Group and related cases - Case No. 01E07974

(Testimony on the relationship between the production practices of Motion Picture and Television industries)

### **Education:**

M.A. and Ph.D. Department of Film and Television University of California at Los Angeles (Awarded the Charles Boyer Fellowship to study at the Institute for Advanced Cinema Studies in Paris, France)

Dissertation: "The Textual Analysis of the American Television Commercial"

B.A.

Major: Philosophy

Studied in Aix-en-Provence, France (Junior Year Abroad Program)

Kalamazoo College, Kalamazoo Michigan

### Personal Data:

Health: Excellent

Height: 6' 3" / Weight: 195 lbs Second Language: French